PAB Policy and Oversight
Data Transparency and Right to Know

August 24, 2023

❋ PAB

Data Transparency

Overarching Ideas

1. **Working with Measures for Justice**
   - Nature of data reporting
   - Frequency of updates
2. **Notes on dataset-specific recommendations**
   - Report what you can
   - Timeline updates

1. The RPD's work with Measures for Justice will benefit the community with a big picture understanding of police activity. We are eager to see the product of this partnership. The existing work of Measures for Justice only portrays aggregated data. As they mention on the Commons website, "The data presented here are intended to show general patterns and to highlight areas that might need further investigation." To meet best practices, our recommendations call for the release of incident-level data. Additionally, we recommend that data be up-to-date. At present, the Monroe County Commons website contains data through March 2023.
2. For all of our recommendations on data transparency, we hope that missing one or some of the element(s) does not deter the RPD from releasing a best-effort dataset.

In the interest of time, this presentation did not address all of the Chief's responses.

Data Transparency

❋PAB

2023-01-6: Complaints Dataset

1. **50A Discipline Portal (included in response to 2023-01-2)**
2. **Example dataset from New Orleans Police Department**
3. **New PSS quarterly and annual reports**
   - Information to be included
   - Downloadable dataset
4. **Timeline Update**

1. The Chief mentioned in response to recommendation 2023-01-2, "The 50A discipline portal is already publicly available." This database is a very helpful resource containing raw data, providing invaluable information to the community. The Chief also said in response to recommendation 2023-01-6 that PSS would be open to publishing new quarterly and annual reports. To clarify, the PAB recommends publishing an additional *tabular dataset* of complaints of police misconduct on the open data portal, where each row represents one complaint.
2. Here is a good example of an up-to-date, downloadable dataset of complaints from the New Orleans Police Department: https://data.nola.gov/Public-Safety-and-Preparedness/NOPD-Misconduct-Complaints/gz2m-ef5u

Data Transparency ✹PAB

2023-01-8: Use of Force Dataset

1. ~~Clarification on "information about internal review"~~
2. FBI Use of Force Data Collection Program
3. Example dataset (Burlington, VT)
4. Timeline Update

1. All uses of force are internally reviewed, so strike the first item.
2. In response to recommendation 2023-01-8, Chief Smith said, "We need to see what data is available and what we will be able to release." In our meeting, Captain Swetman confirmed that the RPD reports use of force data to New York State, in accordance with the FBI's National Use of Force Data Collection Program. The RPD's participation in this program suggests that there is an automated process for distributing this data. We are hopeful that this recommendation can be implemented, resulting in an up-to-date, downloadable tabular dataset with deidentified information about each incident.
3. Here is a good example of a downloadable (but not up-to-date) use of force dataset from Burlington, VT: https://data.burlingtonvt.gov/datasets/burlingtonvt::use-of-force/explore

Data Transparency

⁂ PAB

2023-01-9: Arrest Dataset

1. Clarification on use of Mental Hygiene Detention
2. Timeline update

1. PAB recommended including a data element called "use of Mental Hygiene Detention." To clarify, we intended for this element to be binary (yes/no). The inclusion of this recommendation came from the community's strong response to the draft proposal.
2. The PIC team publishes a dashboard with aggregated data on the City website. The dashboard includes information about co-response with RPD, but it would be helpful to see such information on the RPD's open data portal as well. https://www.cityofrochester.gov/person-in-crisis-team/
3. Here is a good example of an up-to-date, downloadable arrest dataset from Providence, RI: https://data.providenceri.gov/Public-Safety/Providence-Police-Department-Arrests-and-Citations/vank-fyx9

Data Transparency

2023-01-10: Calls for Service Dataset

1. OBI progress on bridging new system with legacy data
2. Timeline update

Here is a good example of an up-to-date, downloadable calls for service dataset from Detroit: https://data.detroitmi.gov/datasets/911-calls-for-service/explore?showTable=true

Data Transparency ⁜ PAB

2023-01-11: Traffic, Bicyclist, and Pedestrian Stop Dataset

1. Comparison to CA RIPA collection
2. Example dataset (Syracuse)

What data do we need to collect?

Article 3 of the Regulation (CCR 999.26 (pdf)) identifies the data elements to be reported, to include*:

1. ORI number
2. Date, time, and duration of the stop
3. Location of stop
4. Perceived race or ethnicity of person stopped
5. Perceived gender of person stopped
6. Person stopped perceived to be LGBT
7. Perceived age of person stopped
8. Person stopped has limited or no English fluency
9. Perceived or known disability or person stopped
10. Reason for stop
11. Stop made in response to a call for service
12. Actions taken by officer during stop
13. Results of stop
14. Officer's Identification (ID) Number
15. Officer's years of experience
16. Type of assignment of officer

* See Regulation for each item specific explanation

1. The public input process for this proposal revealed that this recommendation has high priority in the community. In response to recommendation 2023-01-11, Chief Smith said, "Mirroring the RIPA data collection program is a massive undertaking that would extend well beyond the RPD." Can you share more about what barriers the RPD has identified in collecting the elements required in California? Maybe there is some way PAB could help ease those barriers. We could also connect the RPD with the team from the CA Attorney General's Office that trains law enforcement agencies in RIPA collection and reporting.
2. Most importantly, we hope that the RPD would release a best-effort dataset even without all of the elements listed in the recommendation.
3. Here is a good example of up-to-date, downloadable stop datasets from Syracuse: https://www.syr.gov/Departments/Police/Public-Information/Right-to-Know-Data

Data Transparency

PAB

2023-01-12: Training Updates

1. **Clarification on recommendation**

In response to recommendation 2023-01-12, Chief Smith mentioned the risk associated with putting live training on the internet. This recommendation may have been miscommunicated. The spirit of the recommendation is to encourage sharing information about the frequency of trainings and summary descriptions, similar to the level of detail that the RPD would feel comfortable sharing for the Citizen's Police Academy.

Data Transparency ❊ PAB

2023-01-13: Crime Dataset

1. Demographic data
2. Timeline update

In response to recommendation 2023-01-13, Chief Smith said, "Where applicable, demographic data could also be made available." This would be a great addition to an already detailed dataset. Can you share more about where it would or would not be applicable?

Data Transparency

✳ PAB

2023-01-15 and 16: Maintain and track changes of historical versions rules, regulations, and orders

1. Clarification
2. Examples
   - NYC Privacy Policy
   - Federal Regulations eCFR

To clarify, this is a transparency convention borrowed from legislative bodies. We appreciate that historical versions of public documents can be obtained via FOIL request when necessary. The spirit of these two recommendations is to encourage a proactive approach to transparency.

Here is a low-budget, low-tech example of version control from New York City's Office of Technology and Innovation. Every time the document is updated, there is a description of the changes. https://www.nyc.gov/assets/oti/downloads/pdf/citywide-privacy-protection-policies-protocols.pdf

Here is a high-budget, high-tech example for the Code of Federal Regulations. I included this example to show what *can be*. https://www.ecfr.gov/

Here is a middle path example from the Austin Police Department: https://www.austintexas.gov/page/apd-general-orders

Data Transparency

PAB

2023-01-18: Pursuit Dataset

1. Timeline update