Police Data Transparency

A Proposal for Change

Table of Contents

What is a Proposal for Change?

PAB Policy Recommendations

Pursuant to City Charter Article 18-5(K)(1), the Police Accountability Board shall review and assess RPD policies, procedures, patterns and practices and recommend changes with input from the community. In April 2021, the PAB voted to execute this duty with a process called Proposals for Change. A Proposal for Change is a community and data-driven process where the PAB makes formal recommendations to change policies and practices that impact the Rochester Police Department.

Pursuant to City Charter Article 18-5(K)(2), PAB shall send policy recommendations to the Chief of Police, the Mayor, and City Council.

Pursuant to City Charter Article 18-5(K)(4), the Chief of Police shall respond to PAB, the Mayor, and City Council within 30 days. This written response should include an explanation of why the Chief agrees or disagrees with the recommendations.

Pursuant to City Charter Article 18-5(K)(5), if the Chief of Police agrees with a recommendation, they shall provide a timeline of implementation.

Pursuant to City Charter Article 18-5(K)(6), PAB shall track the implementation of the policy recommendations on our website, rocpab.org.

Police Data Transparency: A Proposal for Change

This Proposal for Change makes formal recommendations about the collection and reporting of information about what the police do. The Police Accountability Board published the draft of "Police Data Transparency: A Proposal for Change" in English and Spanish on September 26, 2022. The public input period originally ran from September 26, 2022, to October 26, 2022, but was extended to January 24, 2023. PAB collected input in multiple formats: online form, email, website comments, telephone, in-person and virtual feedback sessions. Fifty-seven people participated in the public input process. This final version of the Proposal for Change has incorporated that input.

The Police Accountability Board voted to approve this Proposal for Change on May 18, 2023. The Proposal for Change was published on our website, rocpab.org, and transmitted to the Chief of Police, the Mayor, and City Council on May 19, 2023.

Executive Summary

Data Transparency at the Rochester Police Department

We can't improve what we don't measure. Civilians and decision makers alike can use police data as a tool for evaluation and accountability. This analysis of the Rochester Police Department's publicly available resources reveals that RPD does not consistently adhere to best practices for data transparency. Overall, Rochester performs averagely among 94 locations in the Police Data Transparency Index, developed by the Vera Institute of Justice.[1]

The Police Accountability Board recommends that the Rochester Police Department implement the changes listed throughout this proposal to meet its stated goal to "enhance RPD's open data portal and provide increased transparency and data sharing with the public."[2]

PAB Recommendations on Data Transparency

To enhance public trust and provide better information to the public, the Police Accountability Board recommends that the Rochester Police Department:

- Ensure that all public datasets are current and machine readable by providing data in a format accessible with commercially available software, such as .csv;
- Include datasets on the open data portal on complaints about police misconduct, instances of officers shooting firearms, use of force, arrests, calls for service, traffic and pedestrian stops, and crime reports;
- Report incident-level information for all datasets, including: location, time, demographic information, and dataset-specific elements as listed in this report;
- Code all incident data and officer-related data with unique identifiers to allow users to link datasets;
- Continually evaluate datasets to adhere to best practices, using the Police Data Transparency Index and examples from other agencies as guidance;
- Engage an outside agency to carry out regular Data Integrity Audits.

Based on the quality of existing RPD resources, such as the crime dataset, it is evident that RPD has the human capital, technology, and raw data required to implement these recommendations.

---

[1] Police Data Transparency Index. Vera Institute of Justice. https://policetransparency.vera.org/
[2] City of Rochester Proposed Budget for 2022-23

Police Data Transparency Index Recommendations

Most police departments publish data about their policies and activities, but the quality of the data varies. The Vera Institute of Justice has developed a Police Data Transparency Index to measure data transparency in police departments across the United States. According to Vera, good data transparency "allows people to see the police activity happening in their communities and can support efforts to hold law enforcement officers accountable for their actions."[3]

The Police Data Transparency Index scores locations on the accessibility and usability of publicly available data in ten categories: complaints about police misconduct, instances of officers shooting firearms, use of force, arrests, calls for service, traffic and pedestrian stops, training, crime reports, contact information, departmental policies. The Vera Institute of Justice did not score Rochester in the Police Data Transparency Index, but they verified PAB's calculation. You can download the calculation file on rocpab.org.

What follows is a category-by-category audit and analysis, as well as recommendations for implementation.

Category of Data	RPD Score	Median Score	High Score	High Score Agency
Overall Score	42	41	70	Chicago Police Department
Complaints About Police Misconduct	54	32	89	New Orleans Police Department
Instances of Officers Shooting Firearms	0	0	88	Portland Police Bureau
Use of Force	0	44	90	Dallas Police Department
Arrests	34	0	77	Colorado Springs Police Department
Calls for Service/911 Calls	31	31	88	City of Detroit
Traffic/Pedestrian Stops	0	0	87	Fresno Police Department
Training	100	100	100	56 of 94 locations
Crime Reports	70	45	81	Cincinnati Police Department
Police Contact Information	100	81	100	Fairfax County Police Department
Policies	100	100	100	86 of 94 locations

---

[3] The Police Data Transparency Index Factsheet. https://policetransparency.vera.org/PTI-factsheet.pdf

Overall Score...**RPD Score: 42/100**

The Rochester Police Department's overall data transparency score of 42 shows that Rochester performs poorly compared to an ideal level of data transparency, but averagely compared to other cities across the country. The overall score of 42 places Rochester at the median of the 94 locations in the Police Data Transparency Index.

The data published by RPD lacks the level of detail necessary to carry out meaningful analyses of police training, activities, and outcomes. More robust data would empower the civilians of Rochester to monitor and evaluate RPD practices, policy compliance, and potential patterns of inequitable policing.

Complaints about Police Misconduct......................................**RPD Score: 54/100**

Information about police misconduct reveals how well police officers comply with laws, department policies, and community norms. A robust dataset on complaints about police misconduct would allow the public to evaluate patterns of misconduct and discipline. The public can see whether discipline varies based on officer or civilian demographics, the source of complaint (internal or external), or some other factor.

RPD has published three distinct resources for complaints about officer misconduct: The RPD Discipline Database,[4] the Civilian Review Dataset,[5] and Professional Standard Section (PSS) annual reports.[6] Each resource is in a different format, and no dataset provides a complete picture of officer misconduct. The score of 54 reflects the highest scoring resource, the Civilian Review Dataset. PAB recommends that RPD streamline all complaint data.

PAB is also required to release information about complaints. The data elements required by PAB are more extensive than our recommendation for RPD.[7]

PAB Recommendation: RPD maintain an up-to-date, downloadable dataset of complaints with incident-level information, including: complaint source (internal or external), location (RPD section, beat, ZIP code), time (occurrence, complaint, investigation), officer and civilian demographics, allegation category, specific allegation, investigation finding, discipline, final disposition, appeal status.

---

[4] City of Rochester Police Department Discipline Database. https://www.cityofrochester.gov/policediscipline/
[5] Civilian Review Open Data. https://data-rpdny.opendata.arcgis.com/datasets/rpdny::civilian-review-open-data/explore
[6] RPD Professional Standards Section Annual Reports https://www.cityofrochester.gov/PSSAnnualReports/
[7] City Charter § 18-11

Instances of Officers Shooting Firearms .... **RPD Score: 0/100**

There are situations where instances of officers shooting firearms might not be captured in use of force data. Such a dataset would report accidental discharges and instances where a firearm is discharged but no target is hit. Data reflecting all discharges could help evaluate training and implementation of firearm policies, frequency of accidental discharge, and patterns of firearm use by individual officers.

No RPD resources could be located on the topic of officers shooting firearms.

PAB Recommendation: RPD create an up-to-date, downloadable dataset of officer firearm discharge with incident-level information, including: fatalities, justification, accidental discharge, body-worn camera footage, location (ZIP code), time, officer and civilian demographics.

Use of Force .... **RPD Score: 0/100**

Data about use of force would reveal how often and under what circumstances RPD officers use force. RPD policy mandates that force be applied appropriately based upon the totality of known circumstances. With access to information about the circumstances, the public could measure the appropriateness of force. It would also aid in evaluating potential patterns of inequitable policing in use of force.

No RPD resources could be located on the topic of use of force. The FBI lists RPD as a participant in its National Use of Force Data Collection program, which requires even more data elements than Vera recommends. PAB recommends that RPD immediately report the same data elements as contained in the National Use of Force Data Collection program. The specific data elements are listed on the FBI's Use of Force Data Collection webpage and in Appendix 1 of this report.[8]

PAB Recommendation: RPD create an up-to-date, downloadable use of force dataset with incident-level information, including: data elements listed in Appendix 1 and information about an internal review of the incident.

Arrests .... **RPD Score: 34/100**

Information about arrests would reveal patterns in RPD's response to crime. The community could monitor whether arrests vary by offense, and whether those variations match community needs. Incident-level arrest data would also aid in evaluating potential patterns of inequitable policing.

RPD currently lists the total number of arrests per year in the departmental annual report.[9]

PAB Recommendation: RPD create an up-to-date, downloadable arrest dataset with incident-level information, including: arrest charge, use of force, use of Mental Hygiene Detention, location (ZIP code), time, officer and civilian demographics.

---

[8] National Use of Force Data Collection. https://www.fbi.gov/services/cjis/ucr/use-of-force
[9] Rochester Police Department Annual Reports (page 24) https://www.cityofrochester.gov/rpdannualreports/

Calls for Service/911 and 311 Calls   **RPD Score: 31/100**

Information about calls for service would allow the public to monitor the level and time of police response to different types of requests. RPD uses the number and duration of calls for service to determine the workload for patrol officers. Making this data public would allow Rochesterians to evaluate whether RPD's response to calls aligns with the needs of the community. This information could also be linked to other datasets, like arrests and use of force, to evaluate potential patterns of inequitable policing.

RPD currently lists the total number of calls for service per year in the departmental annual report.[10]

PAB Recommendation: RPD create an up-to-date, downloadable call for service dataset with incident-level information, including: location (ZIP code), time (origin, dispatch, closing), officer or civilian initiated, call type, dispatch result, outcome, priority level, City of Rochester Person in Crisis Team (PIC) dispatch, Monroe County Forensic Intervention Team (FIT) dispatch.

Traffic/Pedestrian Stops   **RPD Score: 0/100**

Traffic stops are the most common encounters between police and civilians, but police also stop bicyclists and pedestrians.[11] RPD officers may use a traffic stop to conduct a further investigation as long as the officer has probable cause to believe a traffic infraction has occurred.[12] Access to data about traffic, bicyclist, and pedestrian stops would shed light on how often police stop people, and would aid in evaluating potential patterns of inequitable policing.

No RPD resources could be located on the topic of traffic, bicyclist, and pedestrian stops.

In 2020, PAB recommended that RPD collect and release information about enforcement of low-level violations and stops and frisks.[13] The state of California implemented collection and reporting of such information through the Racial and Identity Profiling Act (RIPA), which has allowed for analysis of racial disparities in policing.[14]

PAB recommends that RPD immediately report the same data elements as contained in RIPA, if they are collected, and work to collect and report all RIPA data elements within one year. The specific data elements are listed on the California Department of Justice website and as Appendix 2 in this report.[15] For more information on demographic data, see page 13 of this report.

PAB Recommendation: RPD create an up-to-date, downloadable dataset on traffic, bicyclist, and pedestrian stops with incident-level information listed in Appendix 2.

---

[10] Annual Reports – Rochester Police Department (page 23). https://www.cityofrochester.gov/rpdannualreports/
[11] Contacts between Police and the Public, 2018. https://bjs.ojp.gov/content/pub/pdf/cbpp18st.pdf
[12] RPD L-72-22 Pretextual Vehicle and Traffic Stops. https://data-rpdny.opendata.arcgis.com/documents/rpdny::l-72-22-pretextual-vehicle-and-traffic-stops/explore
[13] Police Reform and Reinvention Collaborative, *Community Response to Governor Cuomo's Executive Order 203*, Appendix C pg 26. https://www.cityofrochester.gov/executiveorder203/
[14] Emily Owens and Jaclyn Rosenquist, Racial and Identity Profiling act (RIPA) in the Los Angeles Police Department (2020).
[15] Underlying Stop Data Regulations, California Racial and Identity Profiling Act of 2015 (AB 953). https://oag.ca.gov/ab953/regulations#categories

Training **RPD Score: 100/100**

Access to RPD training materials allows the public to review the nature, scope, and timing of police training. This information helps the public evaluate police conduct with specific training mandates in mind. Officers often undergo training as discipline for misconduct. Information about the content and frequency of such training allows the public to evaluate the effectiveness of this method of discipline.

Training bulletins can be found on the open data portal.

PAB Recommendation: RPD publish schedules and materials for live or online trainings.

Crime Reports **RPD Score: 70/100**

Information about reported crime allows the public to monitor the state of public safety and examine perceptions of safety in Rochester. Crime report data can help evaluate police efficacy, especially when linked with other datasets like calls for service by measuring the clearance rate of different categories of crimes. This information could also be linked with other datasets to evaluate potential patterns of inequitable policing.

The crime dataset is the highest scoring dataset on the RPD website. This downloadable dataset is updated daily or almost daily and contains up to 37 elements about each incident. The dataset is accompanied by a tool with data visualizations, maps, and descriptive analyses of crime in Rochester.[16]

PAB Recommendation: RPD maintain the existing up-to-date, downloadable crime dataset with additional incident-level information, including: location, time, demographics (officer, victim, accused), charge.

Police Contact Information **RPD Score: 100/100**

Not all communication with the police necessitates a call to 911 or 311. By providing contact information for specific departments and employees, RPD can divert otherwise unnecessary calls for service. This access to information shows RPD's willingness to engage with the community outside of investigations and emergency response.

Of the 94 locations in the Police Data Transparency Index, only two scored 100 points. RPD is a leader in sharing contact information for each section office and listing specific officers who act as community liaisons for certain populations, like the Deaf and LGBTQ+ communities.[17]

PAB Recommendation: RPD add a contact email for section offices.

---

[16] Rochester, NY Crime. https://data-rpdny.opendata.arcgis.com/pages/crime
[17] Contact Information – Rochester Police Department https://www.cityofrochester.gov/article.aspx?id=8589935972

Public access to RPD policies is a vital tool for accountability. Civilians should be able review policies to discern whether police officers' actions comply with department policy. When community members understand what police conduct is acceptable according to policy, it is easier to identify misconduct. Access to information about how policies change over time would also allow the community to judge whether RPD policies match contemporary societal norms and ideals.

RPD policies can be found in general orders, standard operating procedures, and manuals on the open data portal.[18]

PAB Recommendation: RPD implement a version control system that tracks specific changes to rules, regulations, and orders. Further, PAB recommends that RPD maintain historical versions of rules, regulations, and orders to allow analysis of changes over time.

Data Transparency Leadership Recommendations

For the Rochester Police Department to become a leader in data transparency, it should also release and regularly update additional data on its open data portal. The Police Accountability Board recommended a variety of data initiatives in a 2020 report.[19] Below are three high priority initiatives that PAB recommends RPD implement.

Comparative Budget Data

RPD's annual budget typically makes up about 20% of the city of Rochester's total budget. Detailed information about the police budget would allow Rochesterians to monitor RPD operations and staffing levels. Program-specific budget and staffing data would also reveal RPD's public safety priorities. Some police budget information is available in the city budget report, a document that spanned 600 pages in 2022, but the data is not machine readable. [20]

PAB recommendation: RPD create up-to-date, downloadable budget datasets with information for each division or unit, including: personnel and associated costs, the number and associated costs of equipment (*i.e.,* guns, TASERs, ShotSpotter, KIPs, electronic surveillance tools, drones, cars, tanks, helicopters), full contracts with external vendors.

---

[18] RPD Open Data Portal. https://data-rpdny.opendata.arcgis.com/
[19] Police Reform and Reinvention Collaborative, *Community Response to Governor Cuomo's Executive Order 203*, Appendix C pg 25-28. https://www.cityofrochester.gov/executiveorder203/
[20] City of Rochester Proposed Budget for 2022-23

Pursuit Driving or Chase Data

RPD officers are permitted to engage in pursuit driving, or car chases, in response to certain serious alleged offenses.[21] Officers are required to consider specific environmental and safety conditions before initiating a pursuit. While legal, pursuit driving is inherently unsafe in city neighborhoods, and can cause injury or death to officers, subjects, and otherwise unrelated individuals. RPD collects information about every pursuit on Form RPD 1408.[22]

PAB Recommendation: RPD create an up-to-date, downloadable chase dataset with incident-level information, including: date, time, location (ZIP code), reason for pursuit, pursuit vehicle speed (police and pursued vehicle), accidents, cost of repairs, injuries (officer, bystander, subject).

Data Integrity Audits

To provide a true sense of transparency in the community, RPD's publicly available data must accurately reflect the reality of officers' interactions with the public. In 2022, a team of investigative journalists and researchers found that officers from the Buffalo Police Department failed to record data on race in one-quarter of traffic stops.[23] Similarly, in 2019 the Office of the Inspector General for the Los Angeles Police Commission reviewed body-worn camera footage from 102 randomly-selected officer-initiated traffic stops. They found that only 60% of the forms associated with officer-initiated stops were fully accurate.[24]

PAB Recommendation: RPD engage an outside agency to carry out regular data integrity audits, comparing a random sample of publicly available data with body-worn camera footage.

---

[21] Rochester Police Department G.O. 530 Pursuit Driving
[22] A copy of from 1408 is appended to Rochester Police Department G.O. 530 Pursuit Driving
[23] WIVB, *Critics say Buffalo Police's traffic enforcement targets minorities – and there's data that supports their claims.* https://www.wivb.com/news/investigates/buffalo-police-tickets-traffic-enforcement-targets-blaminorities-and-theres-data-that-supports-their-claims/
[24] Lost Angeles Police Commission, *Review of Stops Conducted by the Los Angeles Police Department in 2019.* https://www.oig.lacity.org/_files/ugd/b2dd23_d3e88738022547acb55f3ad9dd7a1dcb.pdf

Questions and Resources

Will the Police Accountability Board publish its own data about complaints?

Yes. PAB is required to publish monthly, quarterly, and annual reports on our website. PAB is also required to report incident-level information about complaints, including: public tracking number, complaint category, time, location, video footage, complainant demographic information (age, race, gender), officer demographic information (rank, race, section, gender), presence of witnesses, use of force, discharge of firearm, injuries, medical care.

PAB is also required to publish information about the complaint process, including: complaint and sustain rates by RPD section, consistency of disciplinary decisions between PAB and RPD, type of sanctions imposed and decided upon, number of cases reviewed by PAB, duration of entire complaint process, number of complainants filing a notice of claim against the City while their complaint was being considered by PAB.[25]

How did PAB calculate RPD's police data transparency score?

The Vera Institute of Justice provides open source materials to replicate the methodology of the Police Data Transparency Index.[26] Using this methodology, PAB measured the availability (presence of the data on the web, downloadability) and accessibility (file format of the data, inclusion of demographic data, frequency of updates, etc.) of RPD data to produce a subscore for each category of data.[27] The subscores are presented as a proportion of the total points possible for each category. To calculate the overall score, "Vera weighted the subscores for each data type based on the importance of that data type and calculated a total score out of 100." You can learn more about the Police Data Transparency Index on Vera's website, https://policetransparency.vera.org.

Why does PAB recommend incident-level data?

All police departments are required to report certain information about personnel and activities at the state and federal level. The FBI presents much of the data from this Uniform Crime Reporting Program on its Crime Data Explorer. Since 2021, the FBI has required police departments to report certain information about every incident labelled as a crime, but RPD has not yet participated.[28] With this incident-based reporting system, any individual can decide the level of aggregation to analyze when reviewing crime data.

RPD currently has a robust incident-based crime dataset, but incident-based reporting is helpful in analyses beyond the topic of crime. PAB's data recommendations are driven by 'incident-level information,' which would empower the Rochester community to measure police activity

---

[25] City Charter § 18-11
[26] Vera Institute of Justice Methodology for Police Data Transparency Index. https://policetransparency.vera.org/#/Methodology
[27] PDTI Scoring Metric Rochester PD https://www.rocpab.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/09/PDTI-Scoring-Metric-Rochester.xlsx
[28] National Incident-Based Reporting System (NIBRS). https://www.fbi.gov/services/cjis/ucr/nibrs

more thoroughly. At the same time, the release of incident-level information can cause privacy concerns. PAB's recommendations do not include identifying information like names and addresses to maintain the privacy of individuals.

This topic of aggregation is an important component of data collection and reporting. When data is aggregated, only a summary or the total number of an event is reported. For example, RPD currently reports arrest data in the aggregate, or the total number of arrests each year. Civilians might wonder if RPD makes arrests at different rates in different neighborhoods, or by some other category. When we analyze data with specific categories in mind, we say the data is 'disaggregated by' the category of interest. In the example above, we would be seeking arrest data disaggregated by neighborhood.

What demographic information should RPD report?

PAB recommends that RPD follow the reporting requirements for demographic information put forth in California's Racial and Identity Profiling Act (RIPA), including: perceived race and ethnicity, perceived gender, person perceived to be LGBTQ, perceived limited English fluency, perceived or known disability.[29] RPD officers would complete a form after a stop has occurred. Officers make decisions on their perceptions on a daily basis. It is important for officers to document their perceptions, as it enables a systematic measurement of profiling and inequitable policing. By collecting this data, we can measure and address disparities in policing.

How can the public access RPD's existing data?

RPD publishes data on its open data portal where anyone can review department documents like general orders, standard operating procedures, training manuals, program reviews, and memorandums of understanding. RPD also publishes datasets, maps, and analyses on the open data portal. The City of Rochester's Police Department webpage provides other information like bureau organization, contact details, and departmental reports. Individuals can also request specific information from RPD through New York State's Freedom of Information Law.

In the 2022-23 Budget, RPD's Office of the Chief listed as a goal, "Enhance RPD's open data portal and provide increased transparency and data sharing with the public. Enhance an external platform for data dissemination and analysis." The recommendations in this report would help achieve this goal by strengthening an already valuable resource.

Are there good examples of police data transparency?

The Vera Institute of Justice provides links to every source of data in the Police Data Transparency Index. To compare the resources provided by RPD against the highest scoring resources in the Police Data Transparency Index, view the Police Data Transparency Index Comparison Table, which is listed as Appendix 3 in this report.

---

[29] Racial and Identity Profiling Act (RIPA). California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training. https://post.ca.gov/Racial-and-Identity-Profiling-Act

Appendix 1: Elements in the FBI Use of Force Data Collection

Incident Information

- Date and time
- Total number of officers who applied force
- Number of officers from reporting agency who applied force
- Location
- Location type (street, business, home, etc.)
- Did the officer(s) approach the subjects?
- Was it an ambush incident?
- Was a supervisor or senior officer consulted during the incident?
- Reason for initial contact (routine patrol, traffic stop, etc.)
- If the initial contact was due to unlawful activity, what was the most serious offense the individual was suspected of?
- If applicable, the reporting agency will include the National Incident-Based Reporting System record or local incident number of the report detailing criminal incident information on the subject and/or assault or homicide of a law enforcement officer.
- If the incident involved multiple agencies, the reporting agency should provide case numbers for the other agencies' incident reports

Subject Information

- Age, sex, race, ethnicity, height, and weight
- Injury/death of subject
- Type of force used
- Did the subject direct a threat to the officer or another person?
- Did the subject resist?
- Types of resistance or weapon involvement (threats, active aggression, firearms, etc.)
- Did the subject have a known or apparent impairment, such as mental health condition or being under the influence of drugs or alcohol?
- Was the subject believed to have a weapon?

Officer Information

- Age, sex, race, ethnicity, height, and weight
- Years of service in law enforcement
- Was the officer a full-time employee?
- Was the officer on duty?
- Did the officer discharge a firearm?
- Was the officer injured?
- If so, what was the officer's injury type?

Appendix 2: Elements in California RIPA Data Collection

The regulations require officers to collect several categories of information, known as "data elements," for each stop. Those data elements are:

1. The reporting officer's agency's originating agency identifier, which is a unique identifier assigned by the Federal Bureau of Investigation

2. The date, time, and duration of the stop

3. The location of the stop

4. The race or ethnicity of the stopped person as perceived by the officer

5. The gender of the stopped person as perceived by the officer

6. Whether the officer perceived the stopped person to be LGBT

7. The perceived age of the stopped person as perceived by the officer

8. Whether the officer perceived the stopped person as having limited or no English fluency

9. The perceived or known disability of the stopped person

10. The reason for the stop (such as, the officer stopped the person for a traffic violation or because the officer had reasonable suspicion that the person committed a crime)

11. Whether the stop was made in response to a call for service

12. All of the actions taken by the officer during the stop

13. The basis for any search

14. Whether any contraband of evidence is discovered

15. The result of the stop (such as, the officer arrested the person or took no action)

16. The officer's identification number, which is the permanent identification number assigned by the officer's law enforcement agency to the reporting officer and which will be used for all stop data reporting to the Department

17. The officer's years of experience at the time of the stop

18. The officer's assignment at the time of the stop (such as patrol or gang enforcement)

Appendix 3: Police Data Transparency Index Comparison Table

Category	RPD Score	RPD Resource	Median Score	High Score	High Score Agency	High Score Resource
Complaints About Police Misconduct	54	(1) Civilian Review Dataset (2) PSS Annual Reports (3) Police Discipline Files	32	89	New Orleans Police Department	New Orleans PD Misconduct Complaints
Instances of Officers Shooting Firearms	0	Unable to locate data	0	88	Portland Police Bureau	Portland PB Officer Involved Shooting Dashboard
Use of Force	0	Unable to locate data	44	90	Dallas Police Department	Dallas PD Police Response to Resistance annual datasets
Arrests	34	RPD Annual Reports (See page 24 of 2021 report)	0	77	Colorado Springs Police Department	Colorado Springs PD Arrests Page
Calls for Service/911 Calls	31	RPD Annual Reports (See page 23 of 2021 report)	31	88	City of Detroit	Detroit 911 Calls for Service Dataset
Traffic/Pedestrian Stops	0	Unable to locate data	0	87	Fresno Police Department	California DOJ OpenJustice
Training	100	RPD Open Data Portal	100	100	56 of 94 locations	Vera PDTI Training Page
Crime Reports	70	Crime Page on RPD Open Data Portal	45	81	Cincinnati Police Department	Cincinnati PD Reported Crime Dashboard
Police Contact Information	100	RPD Contact Information	81	100	Fairfax County Police Department	Fairfax County PD Homepage (See District Sections)
Policies	100	RPD Open Data Portal	100	100	86 of 94 locations	Vera PDTI Policies Page

List of Web Links for Print Readers

Vera Police Data Transparency Index Homepage: https://policetransparency.vera.org/

Civilian Review Dataset: https://data-rpdny.opendata.arcgis.com/datasets/civilian-review-open-data/explore

Professional Standards Section (PSS) Annual Reports: https://www.cityofrochester.gov/PSSAnnualReports/

Police Discipline Files: https://www.cityofrochester.gov/policediscipline/

RPD Annual Reports: https://www.cityofrochester.gov/rpdannualreports/

RPD Open Data Portal: https://data-rpdny.opendata.arcgis.com/

Crime Page on RPD Open Data Portal: https://data-rpdny.opendata.arcgis.com/pages/crime

RPD Contact Information: https://www.cityofrochester.gov/article.aspx?id=8589935972

New Orleans PD Misconduct Complaints: https://data.nola.gov/Public-Safety-and-Preparedness/NOPD-Misconduct-Complaints/gz2m-ef5u

Portland PB Officer Involved Shooting Dashboard: https://www.portlandoregon.gov/police/76940

Dallas PD Police Response to Resistance annual datasets: https://www.dallasopendata.com/browse?limitTo=datasets&q=police&tags=use+of+force

Colorado Springs PD Arrests Page: https://policedata.coloradosprings.gov/stories/s/Arrests/kh4i-nmaz

Detroit 911 Calls for Service Dataset: https://data.detroitmi.gov/datasets/911-calls-for-service

Vera PDTI Training Page: https://policetransparency.vera.org/#/training

Cincinnati PD Reported Crime Dashboard: https://insights.cincinnati-oh.gov/stories/s/8eaa-xrvz

Fairfax County PD Homepage: https://www.fairfaxcounty.gov/police/fairfax-county-police-department

Vera PDTI Policies Page: https://policetransparency.vera.org/#/policies