

**Finance Committee Meeting
Police Accountability Board
May 3, 2022 at 6:30 PM
Conducted Over Zoom**

Attendees

Board Members: Harrison, Harvey

Staff: Dwyer Reynolds, Antonetti, Pacheco-Walker

Guests:

Item	Details	Vote	Time
Start of Meeting	<u>Welcome & Introductions:</u> Committee Chair Harrison called the meeting to order.	N/A	6:40PM
Meeting Discussion	<p>Harrison begun by noting concerns that because PAB did not spend its entire budget in the previous fiscal year that we may face an attempt to restrict the budget for next year based on the fact that the entire \$5 million was not spent. Further noted that it would be helpful to compare this year's budget with last year's expenditures, Also asked if the Committee could review the initial proposed budget for this year.</p> <p>Dwyer Reynolds replied that the review made sense and explained that Rosabel Antonetti, Chief of Operations, is the steward of the budget. Noted that he does not want her to dive into the details tonight because she does not have them all prepared, but thought that she could at least answer about whether or not PAB is on track to spend the \$5 million this year.</p> <p>Antonetti responded that PAB was on track to spend the entire budget this year.</p> <p>Harrison stated that the spreadsheet that he provided looked as though PAB was only spending 3 of the 5 million.</p> <p>Antonetti explained that the spreadsheet is currently showing \$3.5 million in expenditures, but that she has made several requisitions for equipment that are not yet reflected there.</p> <p>Dwyer Reynolds also noted that the lease contract was recently submitted and not reflected on the spreadsheet.</p> <p>Harrison asked if professional services had been included on the spreadsheet. Antonetti answered that they were not included and had also been recently submitted.</p>		

**Finance Committee Meeting
Police Accountability Board
May 3, 2022 at 6:30 PM
Conducted Over Zoom**

	<p>Dwyer Reynolds added that the info on the spreadsheet is up to date, however, it takes time for procurements to be entered into the system and approved.</p> <p>Harvey asked if the missing requisitions amount to the \$1.5 million that must be spent. Antonetti confirmed and explained that a portion would be the NYS grant which will carry into the new fiscal year. \$1million is for rent, PAB's vehicles, and for installation of private, soundproof interview areas. Along with the equipment purchased for the office space, the expenditures come very close to that amount.</p> <p>Harvey asked if Antonetti could speak about the vehicles. Antonetti replied that PAB is purchasing 5 vehicles using funds from the operating budget as they were not approved procurements under the Capital Improvement Plan. Expects to have the vehicles by the Summer.</p> <p>Dwyer Reynolds mentioned that the vehicles are going to be used for community engagement events, to distribute and collect complaint forms, and to go on-scene when necessary. Those factors necessitate enough travel that PAB's consultants suggested that the agency purchase vehicles. Asked what the average cost of the vehicles.</p> <p>Antonetti responded they could be anywhere between \$25,000-\$40,000. Dwyer Reynolds and Antonetti confirmed they were trying to keep to the low end of the spectrum.</p> <p>Harrison asked why there is a line item for mileage. Antonetti replied that it is to reimburse employees for travel related to professional development. Dwyer Reynolds added that the line item was also for Board Member reimbursement.</p> <p>Dwyer Reynolds noted items that were still needed include digital forensic equipment, cameras, recorders, tablets, and other 'tools of the trade' for Investigators. Also noted that a few thousand dollars would need to go to high quality computers for data analysis.</p> <p>Harrison asked if that list of equipment still needed would be added to the budget as an appendix.</p> <p>Dwyer Reynolds answered that those items will be purchased with this year's budget and will not be a part of the presentation to City Council. Dwyer Reynolds emphasized that the \$500,000 grant will</p>		
--	---	--	--

**Finance Committee Meeting
Police Accountability Board
May 3, 2022 at 6:30 PM
Conducted Over Zoom**

	<p>be used next year, asked Antonetti to confirm what the grant will be spent on. Antonetti answered that the grant will be used for 1 year of office space rent, advertising, printed materials, artist engagement, and to cover the cost of holding public opinion forums.</p> <p>Harrison noted that typically grants are not given free of stipulations and asked what stipulations are attached to the grant. Dwyer Reynolds explained that the funds were earmarked for PAB's general use. Harrison stated that he just wants to make sure that the funds are used properly. Dwyer Reynolds stated that Antonetti has been working closely with the City's Finance Department and the State Grantor to ensure that the funds are spent correctly. Antonetti confirmed.</p> <p>With regard to the line item labeled 'air cards' Dwyer Reynolds explained that the line was mislabeled and reflected times when Antonetti had to purchase cell phones or pay cell phone bills. Antonetti added that she had invoices for the purchases reflected in that line. Dwyer Reynolds added that PAB must adhere to the budget categories that the City creates which is why the line appears to be mislabeled.</p> <p>Harvey asked about the line item for 'dues; in the amount of \$217,000 and what was encompassed in that line item. Antonetti responded that dues covers West Law and Clear subscriptions needed for investigations. Dwyer Reynolds added that the dues item covers the fee to access other investigations related databases.</p> <p>Harvey asked for insight into the 'professional services' lines; one being the grant and the other being set aside for Public Affairs. Dwyer Reynolds explained that the \$500,000 is the New York State grant, and it shows up as professional services because that is the way that the City has marked the funds. Further explained that the Public Affairs professional services budget is for things like canvassing campaigns, advertisements, printed information and materials, and to continue PAB's work with Causewave on the communications strategy.</p> <p>Harvey asked about the \$352,000 being used for rent and storage. Dwyer Reynolds clarified that it was \$352,000 per year which covers the rent and all of the office furniture in the space. Noted that the first year of rent would be covered by the State grant.</p>		
--	--	--	--

**Finance Committee Meeting
Police Accountability Board
May 3, 2022 at 6:30 PM
Conducted Over Zoom**

	<p>Harrison stated that it seems like a waste to spend the grant that way and asked why it was allotted for rent. Dwyer Reynolds replied that PAB is limited in what they are able to spend the grant money on. Explained that PAB's office space could be temporary, and using the grant for rent would allow PAB to open its doors and begin its work as quickly as possible. Noted that it is definitely strange, not the typical grant that Board Members might be used to.</p> <p>Harvey commented for \$30,000 a month PAB must have first class office space. Dwyer Reynolds responded that PAB has very good office space, but that the public must understand that PAB owns desks, chairs, cubicles, conference tables and equipment for over 100 people as a part of the lease. Noted that it is a bargain and suggested creating a rough estimate of the equipment for the public.</p> <p>Harrison asked when PAB would be in the office space. Antonetti replied that there is currently Staff in the space. The remainder of the Staff will be coming Monday, May 9th and that leadership will be inviting Board Members into the space for a tour in the coming week. Dwyer Reynolds noted that there are some delays being caused as they wait for the City to authorize Building services to come in and move equipment and furniture.</p> <p>Harvey asked if Dwyer Reynolds could define 'Staff' and its levels. Dwyer Reynolds explained that there are paid employees of PAB, made up of attorneys, investigators, case managers, policy analysts, etc. Many answer to a Chief like Antonetti. Senior Staff are those who have 'Chief' in their title. Sr. Staff includes Conor Dwyer Reynolds as Executive Director, Rosabel Antonetti as Chief of Operations, Natalie Banks as Chief of Public Affairs, Duwane Bascoe as acting Chief of Investigations, Michael Higgins as Chief of Policy and Oversight, and the role of General Counsel, which has not yet been filled.</p> <p>Harrison mentioned that he had a copy of the proposed staffing model for 2022-2023 that shows the Executive Office in a way that would suggest that it is Sr. Staff, contrary to what Dwyer Reynolds described. Also mentioned that he does not like seeing 'Accountability Inspectors 1-5' scattered throughout different Divisions in the Staffing model as there is no easy way to differentiate Inspectors across the Divisions. Dwyer Reynolds answered that that is a result of the Civil Service Process. Noted that PAB Staff goes by their working titles, but for the sake of the</p>		
--	---	--	--

**Finance Committee Meeting
Police Accountability Board
May 3, 2022 at 6:30 PM
Conducted Over Zoom**

	<p>Civil Service System and the City’s HR, they must have those titles as well.</p> <p>Harvey asked if the jobs and job descriptions are delineated distinctly enough that the public could see the differences in these roles. Dwyer Reynolds explained that whenever PAB interacts with the Public around jobs and staffing, they never use what is being seen. It is an internal mechanism. Further noted that on the website, PAB advertises jobs in language that can be easily understood. Civil Service titles aren’t hidden, but working titles and descriptions are used to give the public a sense of what the role actually does. With regard to the budget it is the same, leadership does not talk about the budget using spreadsheets or internally standardized language.</p> <p>Harrison suggested that many of the items be ‘footnoted’ with explanations, anything to help diminish confusion in the budget process.</p> <p>Harvey agreed, stated that by no means should leadership seek to detail everything, but he does appreciate the simplicity of this budget and the more that it can be simplified and clarified the better.</p> <p>Antonetti thanked the Board Members for their suggestions.</p>		
<p align="center">End of meeting</p>	<p>Meeting adjourned.</p>	<p align="center">N/A</p>	<p align="center">7:18PM</p>

Recording Clerk: Marina Pacheco-Walker